AQ: #1

AQ:

Empirical Relationship between Large Dams and the Alteration in Extreme Precipitation

Faisal Hossain¹

5 Abstract: This study looks at the empirical relationship between the presence of large dams and the potential alteration in extreme **6** precipitation patterns in their vicinity. The global analysis indicates that extreme precipitation has altered considerably more than mean **7** precipitation during the last century. We found this alteration to be more pronounced during the postdam period where the 99th percentile **8** of precipitation experienced an average of 4% increase per year in magnitude. While the density of dams within a given radius did not **9** correlate tangibly with the change in the percentile value, the frequency of rain (average number of rainy days per year) was found to have **10** twice as much correlation during the postdam period than during the predam period. In general, dams in the regions of Southern Africa, **11** India, Western U.S., and Central Asia were found to have increased extreme precipitation more than other regions. It also appeared that **12** large dams alter extreme precipitation patterns more in the arid/semiarid regions more than other places. The study confirms that the **13** impact of large dams on extreme precipitation is clearly a function of surrounding mesoscale and land-use conditions and that more **14** research is necessary to gain insights on the physical mechanisms of precipitation alteration by dams. What is needed hereafter to **15** understand how a reservoir triggers changes in precipitation patterns and affects dam safety is a coupled land-atmosphere modeling **16** approach. Due to the interactions of the atmospheric processes with surface water, understanding and predicting the effect that human-**17** modified flood-frequency behavior has on sustainable dam design and reservoir operations cannot be achieved by stand-alone hydrologic-**18** hydraulic models as has been historically pursued by the engineering profession.

19 DOI: 10.1061/(ASCE)NH.1527-6996.0000013

20 CE Database subject headings: Dam safety; Precipitation; Floods.

21 Author keywords: Large dams; Extreme precipitation; Human modification; Dam safety and flood risks.

23 Introduction

22

24 Research over the past two decades has comprehensively proven 25 that a systematic change in land use and land cover (LULC) can **26** alter the state of regional hydroclimatology [for a comprehensive 27 summary, refer to Pielke (2005), Feddema et al. (2005), Pielke 28 et al. (2007), and Ray et al. (2009)]. For example, data and mod-29 eling studies support the notion that atmospheric moisture added 30 by irrigation can increase rainfall, provided that the mesoscale 31 conditions are appropriate (Lohar and Pal 1995; Barnston and 32 Schickedanz 1984; Eddy et al. 1975). Similarly, Pielke et al. 33 (1999) showed that the draining of swamps can decrease future 34 precipitation through a negative feedback mechanism. Recent 35 study by Takata et al. (2009) has shown that a large-scale increase 36 in irrigated land can even shift rainfall patterns in the Asian Mon-37 soon. Overall, predicting the change in water availability at the 38 climate scale seems to hinge on our ability to accurately monitor 39 and assimilate land cover change (LCC) in any climate modeling 40 study (Ray et al. 2009).

41 Dams and their impounded reservoirs are one such type of 42 infrastructure that triggers a systematic change in LULC patterns

due to the multiple purposes, such as power generation, irrigation, ⁴³ and recreation that they serve. With the advent of a dam, more 44 land may be brought under irrigation and the downstream regions 45 may become more urbanized due to reduced risk of flooding. In 46 the United States alone, there are about 75,000 dams capable of 47 storing a volume of water almost equaling one year's mean runoff 48 of the nation (Graf 1999). Around the world, the World Commis- 49 sion on Dams reports that there have been at least 45,000 large 50 dams built since the 1930s. It is estimated that half of the world's 51 rivers have at least one dam somewhere along the reach [World 52 Commission on Dams (WCD) 2000]. Other than the impound- 53 ment acting as a large source for direct evaporation, the associ- 54 ated LCC, both upstream and downstream of a dam, is a potential 55 catalyst for alteration in the regional hydroclimatology. Land ir- 56 rigated by reservoir water acts as a further source for evaporation 57 and can potentially alter the frequency of convective storms in the 58 region (Pielke and Zeng 1989).

The past century has witnessed tremendous progress on dam 60 safety against the hazards of earthquakes (e.g., Marcuson et al. 61 1996), piping/seepage (e.g., Casagrande 1961; Sherard 1987), and 62 structural instability (e.g., Terzaghi and LaCroix 1964; Vick and 63 Bromwell 1989). We also have a reasonably good understanding 64 of the postdam effects on aquatic ecology (e.g., Ligon et al. 1995; 65 Richter et al. 1996), riparian vegetation (e.g., Merritt and Cooper 66 2000), and geomorphology (e.g., Graf 2006). Yet, very little is 67 known about the impact of dams and reservoirs on extreme pre-68 cipitation patterns. If a dam-driven LCC can trigger changes in 69 precipitation patterns, then it will mostly likely also change the 70 patterns of extreme precipitation. If extreme precipitation patterns 71 change, then the assumption of stationarity in flood-frequency 72

AQ:

¹Dept. of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Tennessee Technological Univ., Cookeville, TN 38505. E-mail: fhossain@tntech.edu

Note. This manuscript was submitted on May 2, 2009; approved on December 2, 2009; published online on XXXX XX, XXXX. Discussion period open until January 1, 2011; separate discussions must be submitted for individual papers. This paper is part of the *Natural Hazards Review*, Vol. 11, No. 3, August 1, 2010. ©ASCE, ISSN 1527-6988/2010/3-1–XXXX/\$25.00.

⁷³ relationships that is fundamental to the design of flood-safe dams 74 is violated (Milly et al. 2008). It is therefore possible that a large 75 dam may be found years later to actually have been designed for 76 a flood with a much lower recurrence interval (or higher fre-77 quency) than the original design flood. Such a possibility raises 78 concerns on dam safety if the loss of storage (i.e., reservoir fill-up 79 due to sedimentation) is assessed in conjunction with an unac-80 counted increase in magnitude of the design flood volume that 81 would need to be routed through the reservoir.

Although the notion that an impoundment could be built to 82 83 increase rainfall was suggested more than 70 year ago by Jensen 84 (1935), dam design continues to assume as stationary the statisti-85 cal parameters of extreme precipitation events during the life span 86 of a dam. How can we be certain that the design magnitude of a 87 100-year precipitation event for a large dam will not be under-88 mined statistically as a less than 100-year event during the life 89 span of the dam? To what extent can a large reservoir be planned 90 (in terms of volume and surface area of impoundment) with mini-91 mal impact on the regional/local flood-frequency relationship? 92 How much LCC in the vicinity is sustainable to ensure that the 93 dam is flood safe? These are some of the questions that the civil 94 engineering profession must address for a more sustainable 95 climate-friendly design and management of flood-safe dams and **96** reservoirs for the 21st century.

Now that there are a sufficient number of large dams around 97 98 the world with a fairly long record of precipitation, we need to 99 identify, as a first cut, the trends that the existing record of data 100 manifest on the impact of dams to extreme precipitation alter-101 ation. This study therefore looks at the empirical relationship be-102 tween the presence of dams and the potential alteration in extreme 103 precipitation patterns in their vicinity using a global data set of 104 633 large dams and 7,000 precipitation stations. We are motivated 105 by the need to raise awareness of the potential for climate modi-106 fications by man-made water reservoirs and to initiate a funda-107 mental change in the perception of how reservoirs and dams 108 should be operated and designed for the 21st century. In the 109 United States alone, more than 85% of large dams will be over 50 110 years old by 2020, thus becoming prone to higher flood risks not 111 just from loss of storage but also from a potential increase in 112 magnitude of extreme precipitation. Across the globe, more water 113 resource projects will continue to be planned due to increasing 114 water demand from population growth and projected changes in 115 climate. Hence, the potential impact of dams on extreme precipi-116 tation and the conjugal relationship on dam safety cannot be ig-117 nored.

118 Global Datasets on Large Dams and Precipitation

119 A large dam is defined as having a height higher than 15 m from 120 the foundation or holding a reservoir volume of more than 3 121 $\times 10^6$ m³ according to the International Commission on Large 122 Dams (ICOLD). We used a geographic information system (GIS) 123 database on 633 large impoundments from a series of world dam 124 registers published by ICOLD. This GIS database was digitized 125 by the Global Water Systems Project at the Univ. of New Hamp-126 shire and was available at http://atlas.gwsp.org/. For precipitation 127 data, we used the global historical climate network (GHCN)– 128 daily data set. The GHCN-daily currently serves as the official 129 archive for daily meteorological data from the global climate ob-130 serving system surface network of the National Climatic Data 131 Center. This data set is useful for analyzing activities related to 132 the frequency and magnitude of extremes as it contains observa-



Fig. 1. 633 ICOLD large dams overlaid with 92 precipitation stations. The pink circles indicate a 250-mi radius of influence around each precipitation station.

tions at more than 40,000 stations that are distributed across the ¹³³ globe. We identified a set of 92 precipitation stations from the 134 GHCN data set that were distributed around the world and had a 135 sufficiently long record (>60 years) of daily precipitation obser- 136 vations. Approximately half the stations were in the close vicinity 137 of a large ICOLD dam (i.e., within a maximum radius of 500 mi) 138 while the rest were considered not to be in the vicinity. The 139 500-mi radius is considered inclusive of all types of convective 140 events at the local (\sim 10 mi), mesosale (10–100 mi), and synop- 141 tic scale (100–500 mi). 142

Fig. 1 shows the location of the 633 large dams overlaid with 143 the 92 precipitation stations. GHCN station precipitation data 144 were verified against an independent measurement, such as the 145 NEXRAD Stage IV data radar rainfall in the U.S. or the Climate 146 Research Unit data set published by the Univ. of East Anglia. The 147 GHCN data set was found to match closely with the temporal 148 trends with occasionally modest bias at a few stations (see Fig. 2 149 for an example of verification of data at a U.S. GHCN station in 150 a semiarid area). 151



Fig. 2. Comparison of GHCN station rainfall data with NEXRAD Stage IV (radar) rainfall data from the U.S. National Weather Service. GHCN Station ID USC00040983. Location: Borrego Desert Park, Calif.



Fig. 3. Historical time series of P50, P90, P95, and P99 for a GHCN station in Central India. Station Id IN011340100; Location: Satna, Madhya Pradesh.

¹⁵² Empirical Relationships

153 General Trends

154 We analyzed the time series of four percentiles of precipitation— 155 50th, 90th, 95th, and 99th for each station and year. Hereafter, 156 these percentiles will be called P50, P90, P95 and P99, respec-157 tively. The percentiles were computed for a given year using a 158 moving window of the previous 15 years of record at the daily 159 time step. This yielded a fairly stable estimate of the percentiles 160 of precipitation.

161 In order to generalize our analysis of the time series of per-162 centiles, we computed the average annual change (percentage) for 163 a given percentile over a specific time period (i.e., predam period, 164 postdam period, or entire record). As an example, Fig. 3 shows 165 the historical time series of the percentiles for a GHCN station in 166 Central India. The annual percentage change in a percentile value 167 was computed for each year. A positive change for a given year 168 indicated that the magnitude of the percentile had increased rela-169 tive to the previous year. Next, the average annual percentage 170 change was computed for a specific period for each GHCN sta-171 tion. Fig. 4 shows the percentage change in percentile value for 172 the combined set of precipitation stations (those in the vicinity of 173 a dam and vice versa). An increase (positive change) in P99 is 174 observed in the regions of Southern Africa, India, Western U.S.,



Fig. 4. Change in precipitation percentile for P50 and P99 (averaged over the entire GHCN record) for the combined set of stations (those with at least a dam within a 500-mi radius and vice versa)

Table 1. Global Summary of the Mean and Standard Deviation of theAverage Annual Percentage Change in Percentile for All the 92 GHCNStations Studied; "No Dam" Refers to the Set of GHCN Stations beyond500 mi of a Large Dam

		P50 (%)	P90 (%)	P95 (%)	P99 (%)
All stations	Mean	0.153	0.199	0.234	0.326
	Standard deviation	1.11	1.216	1.645	1.774
No dam	Mean	0.124	0.087	0.095	0.188
	Standard deviation	0.511	0.249	0.296	0.647
Predam	Mean	0.000	-0.023	-0.011	0.0049
	Standard deviation	0.0148	0.111	0.093	0.0896
Postdam	Mean	0.252	0.286	0.426	0.488
	Standard deviation	1.855	2.014	2.749	2.841

and Central Asia (Fig. 4). Table 1 shows the mean and standard ¹⁷⁵ deviation in the average annual percentage change in percentiles ¹⁷⁶ for all the 92 GHCN stations studied across the entire record (see ¹⁷⁷ second and third rows of Table 1). The rows below the third row ¹⁷⁸ of the table show the same statistics for the set of stations not ¹⁷⁹ within 500 mi of a dam (no dam) and vice versa (predam and ¹⁸⁰ postdam). Two specific trends are clear from this table: (1) across ¹⁸¹ the globe, extreme precipitation patterns have been much more ¹⁸² sensitive to change in time than the mean precipitation during the ¹⁸³ last century and (2) this temporal sensitivity of extreme precipi- ¹⁸⁴ tation has been most pronounced for stations that are in the vicin- ¹⁸⁵ ity of a large dam during the postdam period. On an average, the ¹⁸⁶ 99th percentile precipitation has increased by more than 4% a ¹⁸⁷ year after the construction of a large dam. ¹⁸⁸

Specific Trends

When only stations with at least one dam within a 250-mi radius 190 are analyzed as a function of predam and postdam scenarios, spe-191 cific and localized trends are observed. For Southern Africa and 192 Southern Europe, dams appeared to have increased extreme pre-193 cipitation (P99) significantly by as much as 20% during the last 194 century. Stations in Southern India are found to have experience 195 modest increase in the P99 value (Fig. 5). In the U.S., the P50 196 (mean) and P99 values are found similarly sensitive to the effect 197 of dams. However, the mid-Western and Western regions are 198 found to be affected more by the presence of dams. These regions 199 experienced an average annual increase in the magnitude for the 200 P99 rainfall event in the ranges of 1–5% during the last century. 201

189

Because accurate identification of the open surface area of a 202 reservoir was difficult to pinpoint from the ICOLD digital data-203 base, we looked into the relationship between the density of dams 204 within a given radius (100, 250, and 500 mi) and the average 205 annual percentage change in percentile. Table 2 shows that there 206 exists weak and rather inconclusive correlation between the num-207 ber of dams within the vicinity and the alteration in extreme pre-208 cipitation. Nevertheless, we show this table to highlight the 209 considerably more insightful powers of using the annual fre-210 quency of rain as an indicator for understanding the impact of 211 dams (discussed next and shown in Table 3).

If a dam alters precipitation, then it is plausible to expect a 213 corresponding change in the frequency of rain. For example, if 214 more precipitation is recycled via local evaporation from a reser- 215



Fig. 5. Same as Fig. 4 but only for stations with at least one dam in a 500-mi radius

²¹⁶ voir and the irrigated land, then one may expect a higher fre-²¹⁷ quency of convective showers after the construction of the dam ²¹⁸ (Pielke and Zeng 1989). Table 3 shows that the number of dams ²¹⁹ within a 500-mi radius is twice as correlated to the frequency of ²²⁰ rain as those GHCN stations with no dams within the same vicin-²²¹ ity. It also indicates that the "zone" of influence of a large dam ²²² may need to be assumed at least 500 mi if its impact on precipi-²²³ tation is to be properly identified. Fig. 6 provides a global sum-²²⁴ mary of the effect of dams on the annual frequency of rain. The ²²⁵ regions of Central and Southern India appeared to have experi-²²⁶ enced the most increase in rain frequency after the construction of ²²⁷ dams. However, this could also be due to changing Monsoonal ²²⁸ patterns in rainfall.

Earlier in Fig. 5, we noted that the extreme precipitation in Southern Europe was affected considerably by the presence of al dams. For a closer look at the temporal analysis of alteration, we selected the GHCN station SP000008280 in Southern Spain. Fig. rais frequency (middle and lowermost panels). The lowermost panel uses a rainfall threshold of 10.0 mm/day as a way to filter out the light/stratiform rain and retain mostly convective rainfall events. If precipitation is being recycled from local evaporation, then most of this recycled rainfall should manifest as convective

Table 2. Correlation between Number of Dams within a Specific Radius and the Average Annual Percentage Change in a Precipitation Percentile

		•	-	1	
100 mi		250 mi		500 mi	
Predam	Postdam	Predam	Postdam	Predam	Postdam
-0.141	-0.041	0.011	-0.050	-0.101	-0.189
0.073	-0.042	0.116	-0.086	0.252	-0.229
0.040	-0.041	0.185	-0.099	0.096	-0.226
0.008	-0.045	0.174	-0.090	-0.033	-0.227
	100 Predam -0.141 0.073 0.040 0.008	100 mi Predam Postdam -0.141 -0.041 0.073 -0.042 0.040 -0.041 0.008 -0.045	100 mi 250 Predam Postdam Predam -0.141 -0.041 0.011 0.073 -0.042 0.116 0.040 -0.041 0.185 0.008 -0.045 0.174	100 mi 250 mi Predam Postdam Predam Postdam -0.141 -0.041 0.011 -0.050 0.073 -0.042 0.116 -0.086 0.040 -0.041 0.185 -0.099 0.008 -0.045 0.174 -0.090	100 mi 250 mi 500 Predam Postdam Predam Postdam Predam -0.141 -0.041 0.011 -0.050 -0.101 0.073 -0.042 0.116 -0.086 0.252 0.040 -0.041 0.185 -0.099 0.096 0.008 -0.045 0.174 -0.090 -0.033

Table 3. Correlation between Number of Dams within a Specific Radius and the Average Number of Rainy Days per Year

100 mi		250) mi	500 mi	
Predam	Postdam	Predam	Postdam	Predam	Postdam
0.001	-0.002	-0.012	0.053	0.119	0.221

4 / NATURAL HAZARDS REVIEW © ASCE / AUGUST 2010



Fig. 6. Effect of dams on the frequency of rain for stations having at least one dam in a 500-mi radius

events. When the time series is analyzed with respect to the dates ²³⁹ of construction of the three large dams in the vicinity of the sta- ²⁴⁰



Fig. 7. Time series of percentiles (uppermost panel) and frequency of rain (middle and lower panels) for GHCN station SP000008280 located in Albacete of Southern Spain. The lower panel shows the time series for frequency of rain exceeding 10 mm/day. Three large dams are within a 500-mi radius of SP000008280: Alarcon (built in 1955), Cijara (built in 1956), and Negratin (built in 1984).

241 tion, it appears that the P99 and the frequency of "convective" 242 rainfall have increased considerably over the last two decades in 243 Southern Spain.

244 Conclusion

245 Because our dam and precipitation data sets were globally com-**246** prehensive and spanning an extensive record (60+ years), we can 247 reasonably claim that extreme precipitation patterns have altered 248 considerably more than mean precipitation during the past cen-249 tury. The alteration in precipitation patterns has been more pro-250 nounced during the postdam period where the 99th percentile of 251 precipitation experienced an average of 4% increase per year in 252 magnitude. While the density of dams within a given radius did 253 not correlate tangibly with the change in the percentile value, the 254 frequency of rain (average number of rainy days per year) was 255 found to have twice as much correlation during the postdam pe-256 riod than during the predam period. In general, dams in the re-257 gions of Southern Africa, India, Western U.S., and Central Asia 258 were found to have increased extreme precipitation more than 259 other regions. It also appeared that large dams alter extreme pre-260 cipitation patterns more in the arid/semiarid regions more than 261 other places.

Our study is not without limitations. As future extension, a 262 263 more appropriate follow up study would be to consider the statis-264 tical significance of the analysis to filter out instances where the 265 postdam impact on precipitation may be more of a chance phe-266 nomenon than anthropogenic. Also, the impact of area under irri-267 gation and reservoir size should be studied in conjunction with **268** precipitation patterns. While our study confirms that the impact of 269 large dams on extreme precipitation is clearly a function of sur-**270** rounding mesoscale and land-use conditions [e.g., see Pielke et al. 271 (2007) and Douglas et al. (2009), more research is necessary to 272 gain insights on the physical mechanisms of precipitation alter-273 ation by dams. What is needed hereafter to understand how a 274 reservoir triggers changes in precipitation patterns and affects 275 dam safety is a coupled land-atmosphere modeling approach. Due 276 to the interactions of the atmospheric processes with surface 277 water, understanding and predicting the effect that human-278 modified flood-frequency behavior has on sustainable dam design 279 and reservoir operations cannot be achieved by stand-alone 280 hydrologic-hydraulic models as has been historically pursued by 281 the engineering profession.

282 References

- 283 Barnston, A. G., and Schickedanz, P. T. (1984). "The effect of irrigation 284 on warm season precipitation in the Southern Great Plains." J. Clim.
- 285 Appl. Meteorol., 23(6), 865-888. 286 Casagrande, A. (1961). "Control of seepage through foundations and AQ: 287 abutment of dam, first rankine lecture." Geotechnique, 11(3), 161-288 182.

- Douglas, E., Beltrán-Przekurat, A., Niyogi, D., Pielke, R. A., Sr., and ²⁸⁹ AQ: Vörösmarty, C. J. (2009). "The impact of agricultural intensification 290 and irrigation on land-atmosphere interactions and Indian monsoon 291 precipitation-A mesoscale modeling perspective." Glob. Planet. 292 Change, 67(1-2), 117-128. 293
- Eddy, J. A., Stidd, C. K., Fowler, W. B., and Helvey, J. D. (1975). 294 AQ: #9 "Irrigation increases rainfall?" Science, 188, 279-281. 295
- Feddema, J. J., et al. (2005). "The importance of land cover change in 296 simulating future climates." Science, 310, 1674-1678. 297
- Graf, W. L. (1999). "Dam nation: A geographic census of American dams 298 and their large-scale hydrologic impacts." Water Resour. Res., 35(4), 299 1305-1311. 300
- Graf, W. L. (2006). "Downstream hydrologic and geomorphic effects of 301 large dams on American rivers." Geomorphology, 79(3-4), 336-360. 302
- Jensen, J. C. (1935). "The relation between surface evaporation from 303 lakes and ponds to precipitation from local thunderstorms in the 304 drought area." Bull. Am. Meteorol. Soc., 16, 142-145. 305
- Ligon, F. K., Dietrich, W. E., and Trush, W. J. (1995). "Downstream 306 ecological effects of dams: A geomorphic perspective." BioScience, 307 45(3), 183-192. 308
- Lohar, D., and Pal, B. (1995). "The effect of irrigation on pre-monsoon 309 season precipitation over Southwest Bengal, India." J. Climate, 8(10), 310 2567-2570. 311
- Marcuson, W. F., III, Hadala, P. F., and Ledbetter, R. H. (1996). "Seismic 312 rehabilitation of earth dams." J. Geotech. Engrg., 122(1), 7-20. 313
- Merritt, D. M., and Cooper, D. J. (2000). "Riparian vegetation and chan- 314 nel change in response to river regulation: A comparative study of 315 regulated and unregulated streams in the Green River Basin, USA." 316 Regul. Rivers: Res. Manage., 16(6), 543-564. 317
- Milly, P. C. D., et al. (2008). "Stationarity is dead: Whither water man- 318 agement." Science, 319, 573-574. 319
- Pielke, R. A., Sr. (2005). "Land use and climate change." Science, 310, 320 1625-1626. 321
- Pielke, R. A., et al. (1999). "The influence of anthropogenic landscape 322 changes on weather in south Florida." Mon. Weather Rev., 127, 1663- 323 1673. 324
- Pielke, R. A., Sr., et al. (2007). "An overview of regional land-use and 325 land-cover impacts on rainfall." Tellus, 59B, 587-601. 326
- Pielke, R. A., and Zeng, X. (1989). "Influence on severe storm develop-327 ment of irrigated land." National Weather Digest, 14, 16-17. 328
- Ray, D. K., Pielke, R. A., Sr., Nair, U. S., Welch, R. M., and Lawton, R. 329 O. (2009). "Importance of land use versus atmospheric information 330 verified from cloud simulations from a frontier region in Costa Rica." 331 J. Geophys. Res., 114, D08113. 332
- Richter, B. D., Baumgartner, J. V., Powell, J., and Braun, D. P. (1996). 333 ۱Q: "Method for assessing hydrologic alteration within ecosystems." Con- 334 serv. Biol., 10(4), 1163-1174. 335
- Sherard, J. L. (1987). "Lessons from the Teton Dam failure." Eng. Geol. 336 (Amsterdam), 24, 239-256. 337
- Takata, K., Saito, K., and Yasunari, T. (2009). "Changes in the Asian 338 AQ: monsoon climate during 1700-1850 induced by pre-industrial cultiva- 339 #11 tion." Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 106(24), 9586-9589. 340
- Terzaghi, K., and LaCroix, Y. (1964). "Mission dam: An earth and rock- 341 fill dam on a highly compressible foundation." Geotechnique, 14(1), 342 14 - 50.343
- Vick, S. G., and Bromwell, L. G. (1989). "Risk analysis for dam design in 344 Karst." J. Geotech. Engrg., 115(6), 819-835. 345

"Vy